SEMINAR IN NUMBER THEORY: PEER REVIEW MIT 18.784, SPRING 2025

INSTRUCTOR: ROBIN ZHANG

1. PEER REVIEW ASSIGNMENT

Peer review is a crucial part of the academic writing process. As part of the writing process for your term paper, you will engage in academic peer review with your classmates. This exercise will help you refine your own mathematical writing by critically engaging with others' work and receiving thoughtful feedback in return.

You will be assigned two drafts to review. Your task is to carefully read each draft and write a 2+ page report with detailed constructive feedback for each draft. Your goal is to help your classmates clarify and strengthen their papers, both mathematically and stylistically.

Content and format. Each peer review report should be written in LAT_EX using the *amsart* class (you may reuse the LAT_EX template from the course website if you wish). Each peer review report should contain at least 2 pages of comments and be formatted similarly to my comments on your first draft, which had the following basic structure.

- A brief summary of the paper's content and exposition, in your own words. Refer to the paper rubric (posted on the course website) for general qualities to keep an eye on. Be sure to both highlight aspects that worked well and mention aspects that could potentially make the paper even better!
- An enumerated list of main comments and an enumerated list of minor comments on the paper's mathematical correctness and exposition. This includes detailed constructive advice, suggestions, questions, confusions, and other comments on the accuracy, completeness, organization, style, grammar, and citations in the paper. It is helpful to suggest specific changes, identify points of confusion during your first read-through, and point out effective or interesting strategies.

Keep your comments *respectful*: aim to help the author improve their work, not to judge it. Make sure your comments are *specific*: it can be difficult for the author to address vague comments like "explain this page more" or "I do not understand this section" – which particular passage is difficult to understand and why? You are also encouraged to highlight areas that you find effective or particularly interesting!

Submission instructions: Email a PDF of each peer review to the paper's author (while CC'ing me) no later than the beginning of class on **Tuesday**, **May 6**. Additionally, print out hard copies of your two peer reviews and bring them to class on May 6 for an in-class discussion session.