# A Chromatic Symmetric Function Conjecture 

Richard P. Stanley

> M.I.T.

## Basic notation

$G$ : simple graph with $d$ vertices
$\boldsymbol{V}$ : vertex set of $G$
$\boldsymbol{E}$ : edge set of $G$
Coloring of $G$ :

$$
\text { any } \boldsymbol{\kappa}: V \rightarrow \mathbb{P}=\{1,2, \ldots\}
$$

Proper coloring:

$$
u v \in E \Rightarrow \kappa(u) \neq \kappa(v)
$$

## The chromatic symmetric function

$$
\boldsymbol{X}_{\boldsymbol{G}}=\boldsymbol{X}_{\boldsymbol{G}}\left(\boldsymbol{x}_{1}, \boldsymbol{x}_{2}, \ldots\right)=\sum_{\text {proper } \kappa: V \rightarrow \mathbb{P}} x^{\kappa}
$$

the chromatic symmetric function of $G$, where

$$
x^{\kappa}=\prod_{v \in V} x_{\kappa(v)}=x_{1}^{\# \kappa^{-1}(1)} x_{2}^{\# \kappa^{-1}(2)} \cdots .
$$

## The chromatic symmetric function

$$
\boldsymbol{X}_{\boldsymbol{G}}=\boldsymbol{X}_{G}\left(\boldsymbol{x}_{1}, \boldsymbol{x}_{2}, \ldots\right)=\sum_{\text {proper } \kappa: V \rightarrow \mathbb{P}} x^{\kappa}
$$

the chromatic symmetric function of $G$, where

$$
\begin{aligned}
& x^{\kappa}=\prod_{v \in V} x_{\kappa(v)}=x_{1}^{\# \kappa^{-1}(1)} x_{2}^{\# \kappa^{-1}(2)} \cdots . \\
& X_{G}\left(1^{n}\right):=X_{G}(\underbrace{1,1, \ldots, 1}_{n 1^{\prime} \mathrm{s}})=\chi_{G}(n),
\end{aligned}
$$

the chromatic polynomial of $G$.

## Example of a monomial



## Simple examples

$$
X_{\text {point }}=x_{1}+x_{2}+x_{3}+\cdots=e_{1}
$$

More generally, let

$$
\boldsymbol{e}_{\boldsymbol{k}}=\sum_{1 \leq i_{1}<\cdots<i_{k}} x_{i_{1}} \cdots x_{i_{k}},
$$

the $k$ th elementary symmetric function. Then

$$
\begin{aligned}
X_{K_{n}} & =n!e_{n} \\
X_{G+H} & =X_{G} \cdot X_{H} .
\end{aligned}
$$

## Acyclic orientations

Acyclic orientation: an orientation o of the edges of $G$ that contains no directed cycle.

## Acyclic orientations

Acyclic orientation: an orientation $\mathfrak{o}$ of the edges of $G$ that contains no directed cycle.

Theorem (RS, 1973). Let $\boldsymbol{a}(\boldsymbol{G})$ denote the number of acyclic orientations of $G$. Then

$$
a(G)=(-1)^{d} \chi_{G}(-1) .
$$

Easy to prove by induction, by deletioncontraction, bijectively, geometrically, etc.

## Fund. thm. of symmetric functions

Write $\boldsymbol{\lambda} \vdash \boldsymbol{d}$ if $\lambda$ is a partition of $d$, i.e.,
$\lambda=\left(\lambda_{1}, \lambda_{2}, \ldots\right)$ where

$$
\lambda_{1} \geq \lambda_{2} \geq \cdots \geq 0, \quad \sum \lambda_{i}=d
$$

Let

$$
e_{\lambda}=e_{\lambda_{1}} e_{\lambda_{2}} \cdots
$$

Fundamental theorem of symmetric functions. Every symmetric function can be uniquely written as a polynomial in the $e_{i}$ 's, or equivalently as a linear combination of $e_{\lambda}$ 's.

## A refinement of $a(G)$

Note that if $\lambda \vdash d$, then $e_{\lambda}\left(1^{n}\right)=\prod\binom{n}{\lambda_{i}}$, so

$$
\left.e_{\lambda}\left(1^{n}\right)\right|_{n=-1}=\prod\binom{-1}{\lambda_{i}}=(-1)^{d} .
$$

Hence if $X_{G}=\sum_{\lambda \vdash d} \boldsymbol{c}_{\boldsymbol{\lambda}} e_{\lambda}$, then

$$
a(G)=\sum_{\lambda \vdash d} c_{\lambda}
$$

## Sinks

Sink of an acylic orientation (or digraph): vertex for which no edges point out (including an isolated vertex).
$a_{k}(G)$ : number of acyclic orientations of $G$ with $k$ sinks
$\ell(\boldsymbol{\lambda})$ : length (number of parts) of $\lambda$

## The sink theorem

Theorem. Let $X_{G}=\sum_{\lambda \vdash d} c_{\lambda} e_{\lambda}$. Then

$$
\sum_{\substack{\lambda \vdash d \\ \ell(\lambda)=k}} c_{\lambda}=a_{k}(G)
$$

## The sink theorem

Theorem. Let $X_{G}=\sum_{\lambda \vdash d} c_{\lambda} e_{\lambda}$. Then

$$
\sum_{\substack{\lambda \vdash-d \\ \ell(\lambda)=k}} c_{\lambda}=a_{k}(G)
$$

Proof based on quasisymmetric functions.

## The sink theorem

Theorem. Let $X_{G}=\sum_{\lambda \vdash d} c_{\lambda} e_{\lambda}$. Then

$$
\sum_{\substack{\lambda \vdash-d \\ \ell(\lambda)=k}} c_{\lambda}=a_{k}(G)
$$

Proof based on quasisymmetric functions.
Open: Is there a simpler proof?

## The claw

Example. Let $G$ be the claw $K_{13}$.


Then

$$
X_{G}=4 e_{4}+5 e_{31}-2 e_{22}+e_{211}
$$

Thus $a_{1}(G)=1, a_{2}(G)=5-2=3, a_{3}(G)=1$, $a(G)=5$.

## The claw

Example. Let $G$ be the claw $K_{13}$.


Then

$$
X_{G}=4 e_{4}+5 e_{31}-2 e_{22}+e_{211}
$$

Thus $a_{1}(G)=1, a_{2}(G)=5-2=3, a_{3}(G)=1$, $a(G)=5$.

When is $X_{G} \boldsymbol{e}$-positive (i.e., each $c_{\lambda} \geq 0$ )?
$3+1$

Let $P$ be a finite poset. Let $3+1$ denote the disjoint union of a 3-element chain and 1-element chain:

$(3+1)$-free posets
$P$ is (3+1)-free if it contains no induced $3+1$.

(3+1)-free
not

## The main conjecture

$\operatorname{inc}(\boldsymbol{P})$ : incomparability graph of $P$ (vertices are elements of $P$; $u v$ is an edge if neither $u \leq v$ nor $v \leq u)$

## The main conjecture

$\operatorname{inc}(\boldsymbol{P})$ : incomparability graph of $P$ (vertices are elements of $P$; $u v$ is an edge if neither $u \leq v$ nor $v \leq u)$

Conjecture. If $P$ is $(\mathbf{3}+\mathbf{1})$-free, then $X_{\operatorname{inc}(P)}$ is e-positive.

## Two comments

- Suggests that for incomparability graphs of $(3+1)$-free posets, $c_{\lambda}$ counts acyclic orientations of $G$ with $\ell(\lambda)$ sinks and some further property depending on $\lambda$.

Open: What is this property?

## Two comments

- Suggests that for incomparability graphs of $(3+1)$-free posets, $c_{\lambda}$ counts acyclic orientations of $G$ with $\ell(\lambda)$ sinks and some further property depending on $\lambda$.

Open: What is this property?

- True if $P$ is $\mathbf{3}$ - free, i.e., $X_{G}$ is e-positive if $G$ is the complement of a bipartite graph. More generally, $X_{G}$ is e-positive if $G$ is the complement of a triangle-free (or $\boldsymbol{K}_{\mathbf{3}}$ - free) graph.


## A simple special case

Fix $\boldsymbol{k} \geq 2$. Define

$$
\boldsymbol{P}_{\boldsymbol{d}}=\sum_{i_{1}, \ldots, i_{d}} x_{i_{1}} \cdots x_{i_{d}}
$$

where $i_{1}, \ldots, i_{d}$ ranges over all sequences of $d$ positive integers such that any $k$ consecutive terms are distinct.

## A simple special case

Fix $\boldsymbol{k} \geq 2$. Define

$$
\boldsymbol{P}_{\boldsymbol{d}}=\sum_{i_{1}, \ldots, i_{d}} x_{i_{1}} \cdots x_{i_{d}}
$$

where $i_{1}, \ldots, i_{d}$ ranges over all sequences of $d$ positive integers such that any $k$ consecutive terms are distinct.

Conjecture. $P_{d}$ is e-positive.

## The case $k=2$

$$
P_{d}=\sum_{i_{1}, \ldots, i_{d}} x_{i_{1}} \cdots x_{i_{d}}
$$

where $i_{j} \geq 1, i_{j} \neq i_{j+1}$.
Theorem (Carlitz).

$$
\sum P_{d} \cdot t^{d}=\frac{\sum_{i \geq 0} e_{i} t^{i}}{1-\sum_{i \geq 1}(i-1) e_{i} t^{i}}
$$

## The case $k=2$

$$
P_{d}=\sum_{i_{1}, \ldots, i_{d}} x_{i_{1}} \cdots x_{i_{d}}
$$

where $i_{j} \geq 1, i_{j} \neq i_{j+1}$.
Theorem (Carlitz).

$$
\sum P_{d} \cdot t^{d}=\frac{\sum_{i \geq 0} e_{i} t^{i}}{1-\sum_{i \geq 1}(i-1) e_{i} t^{i}} .
$$

Corollary. $P_{d}$ is e-positive for $k=2$.

## The case $k=3$

Ben Joseph (2001) probably had a complicated Inclusion-Exclusion proof.

## The case $k=3$

Ben Joseph (2001) probably had a complicated Inclusion-Exclusion proof.
$\sum P_{d} \cdot t^{d}=$
numerator

$$
\overline{1-\left(2 e_{3} t^{3}+6 e_{4} t^{4}+24 e_{5} t^{5}+\left(64 e_{6}+6 e_{51}-e_{33}\right) t^{6}+\cdots\right) .}
$$

## Schur functions

- Schur functions $\left\{s_{\lambda}\right\}$ forms a linear basis for symmetric functions.
- $e_{\lambda}$ is $s$-positive.
- (Gasharov) $X_{G}$ is s-positive if $G$ is the incomparability graph of a $(3+1)$-free poset.
- Conjecture (Gasharov). If $G$ is claw-free, then $X_{G}$ is $s$-positive. (Need not be $e$-positive).


## A final word

When $G$ is a unit interval graph (special case of incomparability graphs of $(3+1)$-free posets), then Haiman found a close connection with Verma modules and Kazhdan-Lustzig polynomials.


